

---

Subject: XML list files in an element-centric structure (was: small issues on "register" and "tLineInfrastructureManagerCode")

Posted by [Susanne Wunsch railML](#) on Thu, 06 Dec 2012 09:53:51 GMT

[View Forum Message](#) <> [Reply to Message](#)

---

Dear Dirk and others,

I want to discuss the general structure of separate XML files as replacement for schema-internal enumeration lists in this 'misc' forum because it concerns all sub-schemas.

Susanne Wunsch <coord@common.railml.org> writes:

> Dirk Bräuer <dirk.braeuer@irfp.de> writes:

>>> concerning the file structure: I would prefer using named attributes

>> rather than default attributes with element names for shortness

>> (<version code='ENEE'> rather than <code>ENEE</code>).

>

> Yes, that is a break in the current railML encoding style.

>

> We often stumble over attributes that would need to occur more than  
> once. That's obviously not possible with XML. We need to convert them to  
> elements so far. That is a "structure-breaking-change". In contrast  
> changing the elements multiplicity from "1" to "unbounded" is a small  
> change.

>

> That's the reason for changing the style concept starting with these new  
> "separate XML file" additions.

I would like to introduce this new style with the separate XML files. There are good reasons for attribute-centric and good reasons for element-centric schemas. These discussions were held in dozens of newsgroups, mailing lists and web-forums for various domains. It's not a railway-specific issue. It's a general XML-style issue. Therefore I would adopt the recommendations of these two conclusions of well-known XML experts. [1] [2]

What would change for the railML style?

\* Promote all attributes to elements, despite of the following

@id, @code, @xml:lang

That change is currently only proposed to the XML list files. The railML schema files keep unchanged.

Any comments, questions, concerns, +1, -1 ... appreciated.

Kind regards...

Susanne

[1] <http://www.ibm.com/developerworks/xml/library/x-eleatt/index.html>

[2] <http://recycledknowledge.blogspot.de/2008/03/elements-or-attributes.html>

Crosspost & Followup-To: railML.misc

--

Susanne Wunsch

Schema Coordinator: railML.common

---