

Dear Dirk,

Am 14.02.2018 um 10:38 schrieb Dirk Bräuer:

> Dear Christian,

>

> I agree with your summary with the exception of one big attention:

>

>> If the mandatory stop is not physically visible by a panel/sign, please model it as an OCP:

>> `<ocp><propOperational>@operationalType="stoppingPoint"`

>

> This is clearly not the original intention of an `<ocp>` nor of "stoppingPoint". It could lead to several further problems and misunderstandings. So, I would best call it a "work-around".

>

> An `<ocp>` is originally intended as a container for "timetable measuring places", e. g. stations and all other "aggregated" infrastructure places which are usually shown in timetables. On the contrary, a non-physical mandatory stop will not necessarily be shown in timetables. In such cases, there will be no passing/stopping times and highly probably no "register" and all that. So why using an `<ocp>` then at all? A non-physical mandatory stop with no timetable relevance is purely a rule, and as long as we have no `<railML><rules>` (and no demand for such a modelling), it should not be modelled in railML.

>

> However, we can agree that `_if_` a non-physical mandatory stop is to be shown in timetables, an `<ocp>` is the right solution.

>

> So, I want to ask you not to recommend the usage of "stoppingPoint". In cases where a modelling of non-physical mandatory stops in railML 2.x is unavoidable, it can be acceptable as a work-around but even then, I would recommend not to use "stoppingPoint" but rather a place-holder-only, an "empty" `<ocp>`.

Thank you very much for your feedback. My adapted proposal for solution would be the following:

If the mandatory stop is indicated by a physical panel/sign at the place of the stop, use:

```
<speedChange>@mandatoryStop="true" together with  
<speedChange>@signalised="true"
```

The `<speedChange>` shall be referenced from the panel/sign modelled as `<signal>`:

```
<signal><speed><speedChangeRef>@ref
```

If the mandatory stop request is not physically visible by a panel/sign,

use:

<speedChange>@mandatoryStop="true" together with
<speedChange>@signalised="false"

I hope you can agree with that solution?

Best regards
Christian

--

Christian Rahmig - Infrastructure scheme coordinator
railML.org (Registry of Associations: VR 5750)
Phone Coordinator: +49 173 2714509; railML.org: +49 351 47582911
Altplauen 19h; 01187 Dresden; Germany www.railml.org
