
Subject: Re: [railML 3.1] border types

Posted by on Tue, 21 Aug 2018 16:10:43 GMT

[View Forum Message](#) <> [Reply to Message](#)

Dear Christian,

currently, we only use <ocp>.<propService>.tariffpoint in an unspecified way but no <border> element.

However, there may be some demand to model areas with borders for statistic purposes, to using this in railML is planned for the future with a lower priority from our side.

But if we would do so, we would use it in a much more generic way. We would not be able to link areas and borders with countries, states or tariff zones. There is too much arbitrariness concerning this in practice. So we would only need "areas" of different "levels" which meet each other at "borders". In each level, areas cannot overlap but we could have unlimited levels. Whether a level is a country, state or tariff zone we do not know. There are much more levels imaginable but I think we cannot describe them in railML.

Some instances:

There are more administrative border types (levels) than "countries" and "states". In many countries, there are districts or counties. In Saxony (and some other German "free states"), there are "[Regierungsamts]Bezirke". There may be sub-authorities (Bestellerorganisationen) of federal authorities (Aufgabenträger) whose borders are not identical to the districts in spite of, by law in Germany, the districts (Kreise und kreisfreie Städte) are responsible for the local public transit... This all leads to a nearly inscrutable nightmare of borders.

There is a border between Germany and Czech Republic. This border crosses the railway line Plauen - Cheb _several_ times. But depending on the level of administration, not all of these border-crossings are the same: For operational purposes like Zuglaufmeldungen, there is (a.f.a.i.k.) only one border-crossing. For legal purposes in a strict sense (police, prosecution), surely all border-crossings count. There may be many graduations between them: Who maintains tracks and ballast in the short Czech sections north-west of Bad Brambach? Who pays property taxes for that (if anyone)? ;-)

So, to come back to your questions:

- > * Which border types do you need from your application perspective?
- > * Which other parameters are essential for you to describe the border point?
- > * Is this list of border types complete?

More than. In my opinion, for railML, it's already too many because as my examples should show, you can possibly not capture all aspects of borders. So, I would prefer a much more simple and generic model.

With best regards,
Dirk.
