Subject: Re: [railml3.1] Make @applicationDirection optional
Posted by christian.rahmig on Tue, 29 Jan 2019 15:03:14 GMT
View Forum Message <> Reply to Message

Dear Thomas,
dear all,

Am 29.12.2018 um 00:36 schrieb Thomas Nygreen:
> [...]
> In the 3.1-RC @applicationDirection is required for both
> <spotLocation>s and <linearLocation>s. Consequently it is
> not possible to position an infrastructure element without
> including @applicationDirection, even if most element types
> do not have any specific direction (see
> https://www.railml.org/forum/index.php?t=msg&th=607,
> including
> https://www.railml.org/forum/index.php?t=msg&th=607& goto=1985&#msg_1985).
> I fear that this will lead to the same confusion that exists
> in 2.x.
>
> The problem can be reduced by making the attribute optional,
> although this would still allow misuse (which is better than
> forcing it). I would prefer an alternate implementation that
> also separated elements that need a direction from the ones
> that do not, but I acknowledge that it would go against the
> general design. (After all, one is free to choose any
> location type for any element.)

The railML 3.1 implementation considers your remarks and makes the attribute @applicationDirection optional (see Trac ticket #266 [1]). By doing so, a missing attribute @applicationDirection may either mean, that the infrastructure element has no application direction or that it is unknown. Consequently, the attribute @applicationDirection has to be provided whenever the direction is known (no default value).

> As a side note: so far, the documentation of this attribute
> and its values is scarce. This increases my fear that this
> attribute will be misinterpreted and misused.

Thank you for your hint. In order not to forget about this issue, I moved the Trac ticket #266 [1] into the Wiki domain.

[1] https://trac.railml.org/ticket/266

Best regards
Christian

--

Christian Rahmig - Infrastructure scheme coordinator
railML.org (Registry of Associations: VR 5750)
Phone Coordinator: +49 173 2714509; railML.org: +49 351 47582911
Altplauen 19h; 01187 Dresden; Germany www.railml.org