
Subject: Re: Missing attributes in the element <switch>
Posted by [Dr. Volker Knollmann](#) on Wed, 25 Nov 2009 18:46:10 GMT
[View Forum Message](#) <> [Reply to Message](#)

On 23/11/09 11:02, Martin Lehmann wrote:

> The element <switch> should have the attributes: "stationOcpRef" and
> "signalBoxOcpRef". The element <signal> supports these two attributes
> already. So why does not the element <switch>, too?

Hmmm... I think you've made a very good point here...

I guess there is definitely an inconsistency between signals and switches.

At a quick glance an easy solution would be to just add the attributes as you proposed in your posting. Right.

But a closer look reveals some concerns:

- * There is a possibility to map tracks to OCPs. This is done via <trackRef> in the OCP's <propEquip>, IIRC. If implicitly all of the track's elements are controlled by the linked OCP then we may NOT ADD the attributes to <switch> but we must REMOVE them from <signal> as they are redundant to the linking via <trackRef>.
- * In case we accept the redundancy: are there any other (controlled) elements that need a tuple of [station, signalBox] to be fully specified? If yes, we should find a common data structure for this and find a clean way to implement it. Adding those attributes one by one to each element sequentially is NOT a good solution... ;-)
- * What is planned for the Interlocking Sub-Schema? Isn't that a better place to store the information? I currently don't know...

Right now I can't say what the best solution would be. Do you have any ideas, Martin? This direct question is not meant to be a punishment for showing some initiative and sending a query to the newsgroup! ;-)

I'd just like hear your (and of course other) opinion since you seem to be currently working with that part of RailML.

Best regards,
Volker

--
Dr. Volker Knollmann
RailML Infrastructure Coordinator
EMail: coord@infrastructure.railml.org

Business contact:

Siemens AG
Industry Sector
I MO RA SPP P5
Ackerstr. 22
38126 Braunschweig
Tel.: +49 (531) 226-2592
Mobile: +49 (173) 236 06 51
mailto:volker.knollmann@siemens.com
