Subject: Re: [railML2] Extension proposal: pattern trains, distributions and slots
Posted by Milan Wölke on Thu, 15 Oct 2020 09:47:47 GMT
View Forum Message <> Reply to Message

Hi Janne,

first of all thanks for your proposal.
I understand that you are interested in adding this to the standard in 2.5. We have discussed this in a first round in the timetable developer group and in general there was positive feedback regarding the idea of adding the possibility to model this kind of patterned approach. However there was also concern regarding the complexity of the chosen approach.

For me one major question is this, if the patternTrain has all the attributes and elements of a train (patternTrain is derived from train in your approach AFAIK), is the meaning of all those attributes and elements clear. For example, what is the meaning of a trainNumber that could be specified for a patternTrain. Same goes for the tafTapTsiID that can be specified for a train and thus as well for a patternTrain?

I read in another post regarding the nor extensions that you introduced rules regarding the train numbers for trainGroups (trainNumbersFrom, trainNumbersTo - https://www.railml.org/forum/index.php?t=msg&th=764& start=0&), which can refer to patternTrains (as they already can refer to trains and patternTrain is intended to be a subclass of train). Wouldnt it make more sense to allow specifying a trainNumber pattern along with the patternTrain rather than providing them only with trainGroup?

Another feedback from the community was, that as the newly introduced complexity of this is rather high, could you provide some examples for this, especially some that refer to trainParts with different operatingPeriods, along with some explaination on how to interprete those?

Another question I came across is the meaning of the cancelled flag for a pattern train? Would cancelled=true mean that all trains described thus are cancelled? How would one model a scenario, where only one/some of the described trains need to be cancelled?

Would be great if you could help my clarifying those so we can better discuss the pros and cons of the modelling. Thanks in advance.

Best regards, Milan