

---

Subject: Re: Stop posts for different train types (was: Haltetafel / stop post)

Posted by on Tue, 12 Mar 2013 19:05:34 GMT

[View Forum Message](#) <> [Reply to Message](#)

---

Dear Susanne,

I do not think that it is good to link infrastructure elements with timetable categories. The categories have the character of “flexible, quickly changing, depending on operators, sometimes a matter of marketing and corporate identity, not very technical”.

The infrastructure, in contrary, should be rather “neutral”, independent from operators. If there is a need for an infrastructure element to express any restriction, it should name the actual physical source.

So it is ok to make attributes like “passenger-carrying” or “non-passenger-carrying” or such, but it should be independent from whether they name their trains “ICE” or “RB” or whatever. Please remember that an IM (EIU) has to be prepared to accept any new TOC (EVU) not knowing how they categorise their trains.

Or the other way ‘round: Imagine you are a TOC preparing a bid for an competition. You have the RailML infrastructure file of the IM but you can only see stop posts for “ICE” and “IC”. You do not know which one to take because you do not see the physical background. So what to do? You could ask the IM but this is not in the sense of RailML files (asking per telephone). And, possibly you do not want to ask because some hours later, everybody would know that you are bidding at this competition (via Drehscheibe Online)...

It is the same reason why I pleaded for deleting of the categoryRefs from <speedChanges>: Infrastructure has to be independent from operators.

Concerning the usage so far existing, it is common not to tread a train consisting of coaching stock but non-passenger-carrying (empty coaching stock) as a “passengerTrain”. Or, with other words: A “passengerTrain“ in the technological sense is only a “passengerTrain“ if it is allowed for passengers to use it...

So I do not see any need for a categoryRef.

If you want to extend something: At infrastructure please always try to describe the physical background / reason.

Best regards,  
Dirk.

---