Subject: Re: RFE for stop description
Posted by Carsten Weber on Tue, 15 Nov 2011 13:59:35 GMT
View Forum Message <> Reply to Message

Hello,

I just would like to start a theme to discuss this topic ...

"Susanne Wunsch" <coord@common.railml.org> schrieb im Newsbeitrag
news:bb2r519n59d.fsf@remi.heep.sax.de...
> Hello railML community,
>
> During our last meeting in Karlsruhe there raised some "requests for
> enhancements" around the 'stopDescription' element. I add some personal
> questions regarding its attributes.
>
> After the discussion, we may copy the conclusions to the appropriate
> wiki page. :-)
>
> commercial="true"
>
> a stop, where passengers/goods may leave or get on the train,
> depending on the 'onOff' attribute
>
> onOff="on"
>
>   passengers/goods may only get on the train, leaving isn't allowed
>
> onOff="off"
>
>   passengers/goods may only leave the train, getting on isn't allowed
>
> onOff="both"
>
>   passengers/goods may leave or get on the train
>
Well, I think we can keep this option away. It is the same as if this
attribute does not exist. So it is a special option to say "boarding only"
or "leaving only".

> stopOnRequest="true"
>
>   the train stops only if passengers/goods from outside/inside the
>   train request for it
>
> stopOnRequest="false"
>
>   the train stops in any case irrespective if there are

>   passengers/goods to get in or leave
>
I think this is the same. False is also meant if this attribute does not
exist at the current ocpTT.

>   purpose="?"
>
>   this attribute doesn't make any sense in case of a "commercial stop"
>
> commercial="false"
>
>   a stop, where passengers/goods aren't allowed to leave or get on the
>   train, it is served for any operational purposes
>
> onOff="?"
>
>   The 'onOff' attribute doesn't provide the value "none"!
>
You are right. But does it make sense to say anything about onOff in case of
an operationalStop?
The value "none" would only be required if you have to give an information
about onOff but it is optional so you do not need this value.
So what would you say: staff is only allowed to board the train? Customs are
only allowed to leave the train?
So I would say: In case of commercial="false" the attribute "onOff" can be
ignored.

> purpose="any description"
>
>   this free text gives some explanation for the operational stop
>   reason
>
> There may be different independent reasons for some operational
> stop. The 'purpose' attribute is no good choice for declaring them, it
> is more useful for extra descriptions. These purposes may be concluded
> in an extensible pre-defined enumeration list:
>
>   * route conflict
>   * staff exchange
>   * goods handling without exchanging
>   * border facilities
>   * costums
>   * ...
>
Maybe shunting as a summary of changing locomotive, add or takeing vehicles
away, joining or splitting, ...

> Additional it would be helpful to define the organization in charge

> for the purpose:
>
>   * Infrastructure Manager (IM)
>   * Railway Undertaking (RU)
>   * Railway Company
>   * ...
>

Well this will be quite difficult. Do we need also an entry for "customs" or
is it a problem of the Railway Undertaking?
Whose fault is it do a change of train direction? Is it because of a missing
track to avoid this stop or is it because of the train operator to change
the row of waggons?

> How about a commercial stop that is also used for some operational
> reasons?
>

Well the combination of both informations is not prohibited. So you can also
say commercial="true" and purpose "staffExchange" why not?

The more difficult question is: What about an operational stop with several
purposes? For example "staffExchange" and "customs"?

The most important question is: How do we need to handle this stop in case
of an operational stop?
So if the purpose is set to "routeConflict" and at the current day the
conflict partner does not exist (e. g. because of a delay) this stop can be
taken away by the infrastructure company without any further information. So
it means "green" at the signal instead of (an expected) red.
Or if the train operation company says: we do not need to do a staff
exchange today the stop can also be taken away. Therefore it would be
helpful to inform the infrastructure operator to set the signal to "green"
to keep the train on runing (if possible).

In this case it might also be helpful to be able to define a flag like
"quarantedPass" in case of a heavy train which can not restart at this ocpTT
if it has to stop there. This will be a little bit in opposition to the
headline "STOPdescription" but I think this is not really tragic.

> What do you think about it?
>

I hope I have written enough above. :)

> Any comments, hints, questions are welcome. :-)

Best regards.

Carsten