

---

Subject: Re: reference from timetable's <stopDescription> to infrastructure's <stopPost>

Posted by \_\_\_\_\_ on Mon, 26 Nov 2012 14:34:52 GMT

[View Forum Message](#) <> [Reply to Message](#)

---

Dear Christian and all others,

I totally agree with your commit - it fits to the conversation from 08.11.2012 [Re: "stop post" / "platform edge" reference from ocpTT].

> For me, it seems to be sufficient to only have a reference to a  
> <stopPost> element...

The only thing is:

>> The 'platformEdgeRef' alone would not be redundant for the very special  
>> case if there are two platform edges at the same track and the train is  
>> scheduled to open the doors at one of them only...

To understand how it came to all the references, please follow the discussions with the above named topic from 08.-09.11.2012 (Susanne Wunsch, Andreas Tanner, Dirk Bräuer).

The main reasons were

- a /platformEdgeRef/ is not enough because there may be several stop posts at one <platformEdge>,
- a /stopPostRef/ is not enough because there may be two platforms at each side of a track...

But anyway, I still agree that the current suggested solution with all the /platformEdgeRef/, /serviceSectionRef/, /stopPostRef/ is not satisfying.

As we already discussed on <stopPosts> and their additional properties, the "selection" of a certain stop post (out from all stop posts which may come available at a track) is operational rule and currently out of RailML. Additionally, we have learned that a train of course may (have to) stop in-between two stop posts. So, to use <stopPosts> for trains is not a general accepted practice. It would possibly lead to the creation of many virtual stop posts, one for each train, which is clearly not intended here so far.

So, I would strongly welcome to create a /platformEdgeRef/ but no /stopPostRef/.

If you agree, to clarify this I would recommend for Wiki:

"Normally, there is a range or section of track where trains should stop regularly. These ranges may typically lay alongside platforms, loading

ramps, or (other) service sections. But they may also lay in "pure" tracks (operational stops, freight-only tracks). The exact place to stop in this range may depend on the train length and other aspects. <stopPost> elements with the attribute /virtual/='true' (virtual stop posts) are intended to describe the extends where these ranges start, end, or significant intermediate places. They are not intended to "disintegrate" a continuous range into discrete, deterministic steps."

Best regards,  
Dirk.

---