
Subject: stopTimes - no reference to the times element
Posted by [Philip Wobst](#) on Fri, 03 Jul 2015 06:57:01 GMT
[View Forum Message](#) <> [Reply to Message](#)

Hello all,

I would like to get some feedback regarding the documentation of the <stopTimes> element (<http://wiki.railml.org/index.php?title=TT:stopTimes>).

Existing Semantics:

The stop time as difference between arrival and departure should be:
minimalTime + operationalReserve + additionalReserve

I would like to add the following 'Open Issue'

The description in the semantics sections gives some rules that refer to the arrival and departure of <times>. However, multiple <times> with different scope can be provided for one <ocpTT>. In such a case it has to be made clear which one was used for the <stopTimes> element - i.e. which <times> element the rules apply to.

Feedback would be appreciated.

--

Philip Wobst
Consultant
Planning and Dispatching Systems
HaCon Ingenieurgesellschaft mbH
Lister Str. 15
30163 Hannover
Germany/Deutschland

Tel. +49 511 33699-498
Fax. +49 511 33699-99
mailto: philip.wobst@hacon.de
<http://www.hacon.de>

Registry Court/Amtsgericht: Hannover HRB 1712
Managing Directors/Geschäftsführer:
Michael Frankenberg, Werner Sommerfeld, Peter Talke

Subject: Re: stopTimes - no reference to the times element
Posted by _____ on Mon, 17 Aug 2015 14:16:54 GMT
[View Forum Message](#) <> [Reply to Message](#)

Dear Philip,

sorry for late answer.

- > However, multiple <times> with
- > different scope can be provided for one <ocpTT>. In such a case it has
- > to be made clear which one was used for the <stopTimes> element - i.e.
- > which <times> element the rules apply to.

The problem in general is comprehensible, I totally agree.

But possibly we are 'hard' on a question of use cases - possibly only a use case can answer your question.

In the following example (excerpt from a 'real world' example):

```
<ocpTT sequence=... ocpRef=... ocpType='stop'>
  <times scope='scheduled' arrival='23:06' departure='23:11' />
  <times scope='published' departure='23:07' />
  <sectionTT ....>
    <runTimes minimalTime='PT37.14S'
operationalReserve='PT1.14S' />
  </sectionTT>
  <stopDescription commercial='true' stopOnRequest='false'>
    <stopTimes minimalTime='PT30S' />
  </stopDescription>
</ocpTT>
```

There are many connections which can only be solved semantically:

- There is only a 'published' departure time - no arrival. Obviously, the 'scheduled' arrival is not superseded by a 'published' arrival but the 'scheduled' departure is superseded by a 'published' one.
- The 'run times' apply to the 'scheduled' time (if they apply to anything at all).
- The 'stop description' is general - it does not need to apply specially to scheduled or published. Both 'stop times' are larger than the minimum.

You see, possibly we cannot define a fixed linkage between stop times and arrival/departure times outside use cases.

However, if you want to do it in general anyway, I would have no objections. My suggestion: Introduce an attribute "scope='scheduled'/'published'/'...'" for <stopDescription>, too, and allow multiple <stopDescription>s.

But, I would then like to be consequent and also define dependencies between different <times> as for instance

- "published overrides scheduled",
- "if no published is given, published is same as scheduled"

a. s. o.

With best regards,
Dirk Bräuer.

Subject: Re: stopTimes - no reference to the times element
Posted by [Vasco Paul Kolmorgen](#) on Thu, 02 Jun 2016 12:55:58 GMT
[View Forum Message](#) <> [Reply to Message](#)

This issue was discussed in the railML's Timetable developer meeting in Berlin on June 2nd, 2016.

Conclusion: The participating developers declared, that the stopTimes are used with the scope of scheduled times currently. A extension to the Wiki entry for TT:stopTimes documentation for this usage shall be added.

railML partners who are using stopTimes with a different scope are asked to post their opinion here.

Regards,

--

Vasco Paul Kolmorgen
railML.org Coordinator
Dresden; Germany www.railml.org
